



**MS IF**  
**PATENT**  
Atty. Docket No. 4086-0168P

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

Applicant: Ulrich KNAACK et al. Conf. No.: 9460  
Appl. No.: 09/955,428 Group: 2875  
Filed: September 19, 2001 Examiner: TSIDULKO, M.  
For: LAMP FOR VEHICLE

**COMMENTS ON EXAMINER'S REASONS FOR ALLOWANCE**

**MS IF**

Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

April 2, 2004

Sir:

In the Notice of Allowance mailed January 5, 2004, the Examiner provided reasons for allowance. Applicants thank the Examiner for the comments regarding the reasons for allowance. However, Applicants respectfully submit that the limitations as set forth in the claims should stand on their own, in defining why the invention is allowable.

For example, the Examiner comments "referring to claim 1, the prior art of record does not show a ring-shaped light conductor element being made of one piece and with two light out-coupling elements being formed from portion of the ring-shaped light conductor element that transmitting into one another because of the ring-shaped structure of the conductor element." Applicants agree that the prior art of record does not show the recited elements. However,

claim 1 does not recite that the ring-shaped light conductor element is made of “one piece.”

The “one piece” limitation is found in dependent claim 3. Therefore, Applicants do not want the Examiner’s comments to imply any additional limitation to claim 1, other than the limitations as specifically recited therein.

It is respectfully submitted that the “one piece” limitation is not needed in claim 1 for patentability. This point was specifically addressed during the telephone interview of October 8, 2003. Further, see the amendment filed November 4, 2003, pages 12-13, under the heading “Telephone Interview.”

If necessary, the Commissioner is hereby authorized in this, concurrent, and further replies, to charge payment or credit any overpayment to Deposit Account No. 02-2448 for any additional fees required under 37 C.F.R. § 1.16 or under 37 C.F.R. § 1.17; particularly, extension of time fees.

Respectfully submitted,

BIRCH, STEWART, KOLASH & BIRCH, LLP

By J. T. Eller #41,458  
James T. Eller, Jr., #39,538

P.O. Box 747  
Falls Church, VA 22032-0747  
(703) 205-8000

JTE/SLL:lmh